ISSN : 1411-0199 E-ISSN : 2338-1884

## Implementation of Librarian Functional Position Career Development Policy (Study at Malang State University)

Andy Fefta Wijaya<sup>1\*</sup>, Achmad Qorni Novianto<sup>2</sup>, Lely Indah Mindarti<sup>3</sup>

#### Abstract

The government has issued career development policies since 1988, until the issuance of Permenpan-RB Number 9 of 2014, but implementation of Permenpan-RB Number 9 of 2014 still leaves some challenges. The objectives of this study are: (1) to explain the implementation of Permenpan-RB Number 9 of 2014 at Malang State University (UM); and (2) knowing the supporting and inhibiting factors. This study uses descriptive qualitative methods. Data collection techniques used in this study were interviews, observation and documentation. The data analysis used in this study is the Miles, Huberman and Saldana analysis models. Research findings: (1) the reluctance of a small number of librarians to take part in the librarianship competency test and carry out professional development activities, (2) the placement of general functional personnel who do not have competence in the library sector to carry out librarians activities due to the lack of librarians and (3) submission cancellations promotion of UM librarians to Main Librarian Position due to limitation of librarianship career paths to positions of middle librarians at Kemenristekdikti. The inhibiting factors for the implementation of Permenpan-RB Number 9 of 2014 in UM are (1) the lack of responsiveness of the Kemenristekdikti in processing proposals for promotion / rank of librarians, and (2) the limited number of competent civil servants to follow inpassing the position of librarians. The implementation of Permenpan-RB Number 9 of 2014 in MUs has not been going well, therefore, a fast response from both librarians and UM leaders is needed to minimize the gap.

Keywords: librarian functional positions, career development, policy implementation

#### INTRODUCTION\*

Librarians are one of the positions of civil servants that are included in certain functional office clusters. The government has established librarian career development policies since 1988. These guidelines include Kepmenpan Number 18 / MENPAN / 1988, Kepmenpan Number 33 of 1998, then replaced by Kepmenpan Number 132 / KEP / M.PAN / 12/2002, and the latter is the issuance of Permenpan-RB Number 9 of 2014 which perfects the policies previously set.

Librarian functional positions are grouped into skilled level librarians (minimum education D II) and expert level librarians (minimum S1 education) [1]. The positions of skilled level librarians include (1) executive librarians, (2) advanced implementing librarians, and (3) supervisor librarians. The level of position of expert librarians includes (1) the first librarian, (2) young librarians, (3) middle librarians, and (4) primary librarians. To be able to rise in rank /

Correspondence address:

Achmad Qorni Novianto

Email : qorni21@gmail.com Address : Fakultas Ilmu Administrasi Universitas Brawijaya rank, librarians must be able to meet the required credit score target. The higher the position / rank of librarians, the greater credit numbers are needed. This makes librarians able to increase work productivity in carrying out librarianship activities to be able to manage their careers.

In this era of globalization which is full of changes, librarians must be able to develop their careers by continuing to study and manage their careers proactively [2]. The most important aspect that influences the success of librarians in their career development (pursuing position and class levels) is the success of librarians in carrying out various tasks such as those included in the elements and sub-elements of librarian activities which can be assessed according to their level and level of office [ 3]. The elements of librarianship activities that can be assessed for credit numbers are (1) education, (2) library management, (3) library services, (4) librarian professional system development, (5) development, and (6) supporting librarian assignments [1].

With a variety of improvements from previous librarian career development policies,

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Program Studi Magister Manajemen Pendidikan Tinggi, Fakultas Ilmu Administrasi, Universitas Brawijaya\*

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> Program Studi Magister Manajemen Pendidikan Tinggi, Fakultas Ilmu Administrasi, Universitas Brawijaya & Unit Pelaksana Teknis Perpustakaan, Universitas Negeri Malang

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> Program Studi Magister Manajemen Pendidikan Tinggi, Fakultas Ilmu Administrasi, Universitas Brawijaya

the implementation of Permenpan-RB Number 9 of 2014 still leaves some problems. Based on the results of previous research [4], there are internal and external factors that influence the increase in rank / position of librarians. Internal factors originate from within the librarian in question, for example: interest, motivation, sincerity, perception of being a librarian, education in the field of library science and interest in working in a library. External factors come from outside the librarian in question, for example: credit scores for librarianship activities that are too small, the work environment is not conducive, the assessment team is less competent in conducting assessments, lack of leadership attention, institutional appreciation for the librarian profession is very lacking, librarian must do other work outside the field of library and information.

Based on preliminary studies conducted by researchers, there are several problems experienced by librarians of the State University of Malang (UM), namely: (1) incompatibility of librarians' position levels with the place of duty, so that the activities carried out cannot be calculated; and (2) the existence of librarians whose submission of promotion to the level of the main librarian is rejected because of the limitation of the librarian's functional position in the position of intermediate librarians in all work units under the auspices of the Ministry of Research, Technology and Higher Education.

Based on the description of the background above, the formulation of the problem in this study is as follows.

- 1. What is the implementation of Permenpan-RB Number 9 of 2014 concerning Librarian Functional Position and Credit Score at UM?
- What are the supporting factors and inhibiting factors that affect the implementation of Permenpan-RB Number 9 of 2014 concerning Librarian Functional Position and Credit Score at UM?

### LITERATURE REVIEW Public Policy

Policy is an effort to define and compile standards to do or not take an action [5]. Public policy is a series of actions in the form of choices to do or not do something in order to achieve the goals of the state which are of public interest by paying attention to available inputs, based on proposals from a person or group of people within the government or outside the government [6]. Based on this explanation, it can

be seen that public policy is all choices that have been set by the government to regulate actions that may or may not be carried out to achieve the goals of the state / public interest. The objective of Permenpan-RB Number 9 of 2014 concerning Librarian Functional Position and Credit Score is to accommodate the demands of career development and increase the professionalism of librarians.

#### **Policy Implementation**

Implementation is an interaction process between determining goals and actions to achieve goals. Through implementation, a policy is used to provide direction in the implementation of various businesses in achieving the expected goals [5]. In a broad sense, implementation is often regarded as a form of operation or implementation of activities that have been determined by law and become a joint agreement among various stakeholders, actors, organizations, procedures and techniques that are synergistically mobilized to work together to pass policy to desired direction [7].

The success of implementation is influenced by two major variables, namely the policy content and implementation environment [8]. Policy content includes: (1) the interests of the target group; (2) types of benefits, (3) degree of change desired; (4) the location of decision making; (5) program implementers; and (6) resources involved. Variable policy context (environment) includes several things that determine the success of policy implementation as follows: (1) power, interests, and strategies; (2) characteristics of institutions and authorities; and (3) compliance and responsiveness (responsiveness) of the target group.

In this study, the model of Merilee S. Grindle's policy implementation was used to answer the problem formulation in the study. This is because the author wants to focus on a comprehensive understanding of the content and context of the implementation of Permenpan-RB Number 9 of 2014, especially those concerned with the implementor and the arena of possible conflicts between implementing actors, as well as the conditions for implementation resources needed.

#### **MATERIAL AND METHOD**

This study uses descriptive qualitative methods. The location of this study is at UM. Data collection techniques used in this study were interviews, observation and documentation

to obtain in-depth data on the implementation of Permenpan-RB Number 9 of 2014 at UM. Data collection in this study was conducted using interview techniques to the Head of Personnel Section, Head of Administrative Section, Head of Library UPT, Head of Administration UPT Library and 11 librarians. Observations were carried out by researchers to observe librarian routine activities. Documentation carried out by researchers regarding documents obtained from librarians, Administration Section of UPT Library and UM Personnel Section related to this research. The data analysis used in this study is the Miles, Huberman and Saldana analysis models with stages: (1) data collection, (2) condensation of data, (3) data presentation and (4) conclusion drawing [9].

## RESULT AND DISCUSSION Implementation of Permenpan-RB Number 9 of 2014 at Malang State University

The benchmark for the success of a policy can be seen by looking at how it is implemented. Policy implementation is implementing the prescribed choices from various alternatives in the formulation and applicable legislation, supported by professional personnel, as well as available infrastructure [10]. If it is related to the theory of Merilee S. Grindle's implementation, the successful implementation of Permenpan-RB Number 9 of 2014 concerning Librarian Functional Position and its Credit Score in UM can be measured from the policy content and policy context.

In the aspect of policy content, it is described as follows.

#### a. Interest of the Target Group

The addition of three new materials on competence in article 33, the formation of positions in article 34, declining positions in article 39 as well as changes and additions to new activities in Permenpan-RB Number 9 of 2014 aim to fulfill the demands of career development and increase librarian professionalism. This is in accordance with the basic definition of policy which is a government response to certain problems, needs and developing aspirations [11].

#### b. Benefit Type

The benefits received due to the implementation of a policy are the results / consequences of the implementation of the policy is a logical consequence that is felt by the community from the actions of the government / leadership to overcome certain problems

experienced by the community [7]. The classic problem experienced by librarians is the discrepancy between the task / tupoksi place and the librarian position level which results in the difficulty for librarians to collect credit numbers for promotion / rank. This can be minimized by Permenpan-RB Number 9 of 2014 through: (1) it is permissible to carry out the main duties of librarians above and at the level below the librarian's position in Article 10 Permenpan-RB Number 9 of 2014, (2) more diverse items and numbers credit is greater than Kepmenpan Number 123 / KEP / M.PAN / 12/2002, and (3) items of professional development activities that can be carried out at all levels of office.

#### c. Level of Desired Change

The desired change in the implementation of Permenpan-RB Number 9 of 2014 is to increase the professionalism of librarians. One of the new material in Permenpan-RB Number 9 of 2014 is the provision of competency tests for librarians who will rise to positions in article 33 Permenpan-RB Number 9 of 2014. Competency test materials for librarians who will rise to office are related to the implementation of types of librarian activities that exist at the position level to be addressed in accordance with attachments I and II Permenpan-RB Number 9 of 2014. With the presence of new activity items and larger credit numbers in most activities in Permenpan-RB Number 9 Year 2014, it was able to minimize the likelihood of librarians being dismissed from their posts because they were unable to obtain credit numbers. However, the most important thing is the motivation of librarians in developing their careers through increasing performance that has an impact on the credit figures obtained. Motivation is closely related to librarian career development, especially intrinsic motivation [12]. Intrinsic motivation is an encouragement to develop themselves and improve their shortcomings by increasing competence and insight as librarians.

#### d. Location of Decision Making

In the aspect of decision making in the implementation of Permenpan-RB Number 9 of 2014, all librarians leaders at UM (UPT Library, FIP Library and Postgraduate Library) apply the principle of flexibility in carrying out librarianship tasks and librarianship career development. In addition, the assessment of librarians' credit numbers at both the UPT level of the Library and the university level is carried out objectively. The evaluation of librarians' credit numbers is the most crucial thing in the stages of promotion /

rank of librarians. This is due to the results of the credit score assessment showing the professionalism of librarians in managing and developing their careers in the field of librarianship [13].

#### e. Program Implementer

In terms of educational qualifications, UM librarians have fulfilled the requirements to functional positions occupy librarian Permenpan-RB Number 2014. Problems related program implementation implementation of Permenpan-RB Number 9 of 2014 must be considered by the UM Library UPT leaders, namely the credit score assessment team librarians do not have sufficient competence in assessing credit numbers. The librarian credit score assessment team currently does not take part in the technical training on credit score assessment at the National Library of Indonesia and has very little experience in assessing credit numbers. With the new librarians' functional position regulations, with new activity items and new regulations, there will certainly be many questions from librarians. This can lead to differences in perceptions regarding the method of calculating credit numbers for each item of activity between the Assessment Team and librarians [13]. Based on this, the leadership of the Library Unit should immediately assign a credit score assessment team to participate in the technical training team of the assessment team in the National Library so that they can carry out their duties properly.

#### f. Resources Involved

Although the educational qualifications of all UM librarians have met the requirements in Permenpan-RB Number 9 of 2014, the number of librarians in UM is still inadequate. The number of UM librarians drastically decreased from year to year due to eight full-time librarians and three librarians who changed functions as lecturers. The limitation of the number of librarians has resulted in general functional staff and employees not necessarily having to carry out librarian activities whose results and quality of work differed from librarians. The limitations of the number of librarians at UM impacted on the existence of several librarians who carried out librarianship activities without obtaining credit numbers, because they had to work on two-level activities below the level of their positions and even outside of their position groups. This is certainly contrary to Article 10 Permenpan-RB Number 9 of 2014 which only allows librarians to carry out activities at the level above and at the

level below the level of their positions. The problem regarding the limited number of librarians at UM while can only be overcome by involving general functional staff to assist the implementation of librarianship tasks and to include general functional personnel who fulfill the requirements to enter librarian functional positions through inpassing. This is due to restrictions on the provision of education personnel (including librarians) within the Ministry of Research, Technology and Higher Education except for the New State Universities (PTNB) that continue to the present. Inpassing in the position of librarians within the Ministry of Research, Technology and Higher Education can be carried out based on Permenpan-RB Number 26 of 2016 concerning the appointment of civil servants in functional positions through inpassing. Inpassing in librarian positions is the only way that is used to overcome the lack of librarian human resources, this is due to restrictions on the definition of librarians in Permenpan-RB Number 9 of 2014 which only recognizes the position of librarians with PNS status.

In terms of the policy context, it will be described as follows.

#### a. Actor Power, Interest and Strategy

One of the main problems that occur in UM is the limited number of librarians currently available which have an impact on the incompatibility of the librarians' position levels with their place of assignment. This can result in obstructed librarian career development because the librarian cannot collect credit numbers from the activities he does on a daily basis. The strategies that have been carried out by the Library UPT leaders to solve these problems include (1) librarian rotation, (2) policy discretion through conversion of credit numbers by librarians credit score assessment teams, and (3) addition of general functional staff and temporary employees. To overcome the lack of librarian human resources at UM, the UM Personnel Department has disseminated information about inpassing to librarian functional positions held by the Ministry of Research, Technology and Higher Education until 2021 and has processed the filing of three prospective librarians from UM.

### b. Characteristics of Ruling Institutions and Regimes

There are several positive impacts that librarians have regarding the characteristics of the ruling institutions and regimes in the

implementation of Permenpan-RB Number 9 of 2014 in UM as follows: (1) the era of leadership of the current Head of the UPT Library (2015current) which provides freedom for librarians who want to develop their competencies and careers, both to take part in trainings to further S1 and S2 studies; and (2) the assessment of librarians' credit numbers that will rise in rank / rank both at the UPT level of the Library and universities is considered very objective and cooperative for librarians. With characteristics of the current UM leadership, the implementation of librarian career development policies at UM can run better without the leadership interests which can harm librarians that occurred in the previous regime.

The main problem regarding characteristics of the institutions and regimes in power in the implementation of the RB Regulation Number 9 of 2019 in UM is the limitation of librarians' position only in the position of Intermediate Librarians in the IV / c room in the Ministry of Research and Technology since 2017 based on the Menristekdikti SE Number 102318 / A2.3 / KP / 2017 concerning the limitation of librarian's functional position in the position of Associate Librarian. This was due to the absence of the class positions of the Main Librarians in the class IV / d and IV / e in the Ministry of Research, Technology and Higher Education. The provision made two failed UM librarians proposed to take office to the Main Librarian even though they had fulfilled all the requirements in accordance with Permenpan-RB Number 9 of 2014. Supposedly, the Ministry of Research and Technology and Higher Education should review the limitation of librarian position only to the Librarian. Since the librarian was first recognized as a functional position in Indonesia through the Decree of the Minister of Manpower No. 18 of 1988 concerning Librarian Functional Position and Credit Numbers, the highest librarians' positions were the main librarians in the class IV / d and IV / e. In addition, most of the Main Librarians in Indonesia come from PTN.

Until now, the solution given by the Ministry of Research, Technology and Higher Education to librarians who want to take office to the Main Librarian is simply to move institutions that have librarian positions, such as the National Library of Indonesia. However, if indeed the final decision for librarians in the Ministry of Research and Technology can only occupy the position of Associate Librarian, it is necessary to provide career guidance for the position of the Middle

Librarian in order to maintain his position, as in Article 17 of RB Number 9 of 2014 which regulates the credit numbers to be collected each year by the Main Librarian and Supervisor Librarian (Maintenance Credit Figures). In addition, the expansion of the role of librarians in this case, for example the development of faculty libraries that have not been well managed, school libraries, village libraries and community reading parks. These roles in the future can be used as consideration for the need for the position of the main librarian in college.

### c. Compliance and Response from the Target Group

Most UM librarians have followed and adhered to the various provisions contained in Permenpan-RB Number 9 of 2014. Even the fiveyear deadline for proposing higher ranks and positions does not make librarians difficult because of the new activity points and larger credit numbers and leadership support that makes librarians more motivated in developing their careers. However, there are several issues regarding the level of compliance responsiveness of librarians the implementation of Permenpan-RB Number 9 of 2014 in UM as follows: (1) although most UM librarians agree to the librarians competency test because it provides a general description of the work to be done after taking office, there are librarians who want to resign from the position of librarians because they refuse to take the competency test and feel they do not have sufficient competence to pass the librarian's competency test. The pros and cons that occur in implementation are commonplace, because the implementation of policies will inevitably enter the realm of conflict issues and complicated decisions [7]; and (2) there are expert librarians who are not able to produce scientific papers because they feel they do not have sufficient competence in preparing scientific papers. This is certainly contrary to Article 15 Permenpan-RB Number 9 of 2014 concerning the obligation of expert librarians to collect credit numbers from professional development activities every time they submit promotions /

# Supporting Factors and Inhibiting Factors of Permenpan-RB Implementation Number 9 of 2014 at Malang State University

Supporting factors for the implementation of Permenpan-RB Number 9 of 2014 in UM include the following.

#### a. Compensation

Compensation is the number of packages offered / given by the organization to employees in return for the use of its workforce [15]. Compensation obtained by librarians according to librarian positions can be an attraction for developing careers in librarian positions. In the UM environment, the compensation obtained by librarians includes librarian functional allowances and remuneration with a grade adjusted to the class / librarian position level. The greater compensation obtained (both functional allowance and remuneration) when occupying a higher level of office can be an encouragement for librarians to develop their careers. In fact, based on Permenristekdikti Number 49 of 2015 the class positions of young librarians and middle librarians are still higher when compared to the position classes of Subdivision Heads which range from the 8th or 9th grade.

#### b. Retirement Age Limits and Opportunities to Achieve Higher Ranks

Expert level librarians who have a minimum rank IV / a get the right to continue working until the age of 60 years. Unlike the general functional staff and structural officials (echelon III and IV) must retire as civil servants when entering the age of 58 years. Being a librarian, especially expert librarians is certainly quite beneficial compared to ordinary general functional personnel who can only reach class III / d if he does not carry out structural positions. With regulations currently in the Ministry of Research, Technology and Higher Education, expert librarians can reach group IV / c at the level of intermediate librarians. Actually, if there is no limitation on the level of position of expert librarians to occupy the position of the main librarian at the Ministry of Research and Technology, there is the opportunity for expert librarians to reach the rank IV / e and get the right to retire at the age of 65. This is in accordance with the provisions in Permenpan-RB Number 9 of 2014 concerning the level of position of expert librarians.

#### c. Motivation

Motivation is an impulse towards a series of processes of human behavior in achieving goals [15]. Basically, all UM librarians are motivated to achieve the highest position / rank in accordance with their abilities and existing regulations. All UM librarians are motivated to achieve the highest rank and position in accordance with existing regulations. Circumstances at UM are quite different when compared to the results of previous research [16] which shows that some

librarians do not have the motivation to advance, so they only take care of promotions / positions if governed by the leadership or if they have received a warning letter from the personnel department because in five years do not propose a promotion / rank. The great motivation possessed by UM librarians is evidenced by the presence of several librarians who have been promoted once in two years.

Supporting factors for the implementation of Permenpan-RB Number 9 of 2014 in UM include the following.

#### a. Kemenristekdikti

The transfer of ministries from the Ministry of Education and Culture to the Ministry of Research, Technology and Higher Education resulted in several new problems experienced by librarians and staffing departments related to the proposed Decree (SK) of promotion and rank of librarians. The process of assessing credit numbers, so that librarians' credit numbers at UM have been in accordance with procedures and carried out according to the set schedule. However, the problem was the delay in issuing decrees from the Ministry of Research, Technology and Higher Education. Librarians who are in other PTNs also experience the same thing related to the delay in decree of position and rank of librarians from the Ministry of Research, Technology and Higher Education. Kemenristekdikti HR Bureau acknowledged that the administrative process delays that occurred at the Kemenristekdikti were caused by a lack of employees. In addition, there have been a number of missing proposals for promotion, so that the Kemenristekdikti recommends data backups at UM so that if there is file loss at Kemenristekdikti, the file can be sent back. Backing up data and maintaining good relations between UM Staffing and Kemenristkedikti are the only solutions. In addition, proactive monitoring must continue to be carried out by the UM Personnel Department to find out where the process of promotion / rank promotion in the Ministry of Research and Technology in order to minimize the delays made by Kemenristekdikti.

### b. Limitations of Competent Human Resources to Follow Inpassing

The problem regarding the lack of librarians in UM, can actually be minimized by the existence of regulations regarding inpassing for civil servants to enter librarian functional positions. However, there is little availability of human resources at UM who fulfill the competence to enter the librarian's functional position. Most of

the existing PN PNS came from the appointment of PNS from Category 1 (K1) and Category 2 (K2) honorary workers, most of whom graduated from high school and below. The civil servants prefer to be general functional personnel because they feel it is too late to start becoming certain functional personnel from the start. Based on data obtained from the UM Personnel Section, it can be seen that there are only three UM PNSs who submitted inpassing to librarian functional positions. Librarian inpassing is one of the solutions to increase the number of librarians because there is no formation for UM to increase education staff to date through the CPNS pathway.

#### CONCLUSION

Based on the results of the research and discussion described in the previous chapter, the implementation of Permenpan-RB Number 9 of 2014 concerning the Functional Position of Librarians in UM can be concluded as follows.

- Implementation of Permenpan-RB Number 9
   of 2014 which regulates the career
   development of librarian functional positions
   at UM has not gone well.
  - a. On the policy content side, the benefits of the presence of new activity items and larger credit numbers can facilitate librarians in collecting credit numbers for promotions / ranks. Various decisions determined by the leadership of the UM related to librarian career development, are based on the principle of flexibility in carrying out librarianship tasks to facilitate librarians collecting credit numbers. However, problems occur in implementation of the policy implementation program, namely the existing librarian credit score assessment team does not yet have adequate competence. In addition, the limited number of UM librarians as the main human resources in implementing this policy has caused some librarianship activities to be carried out by general functional staff and temporary employees.
  - b. In the context of the policy context, the strategy implemented by UM leaders to foster librarian careers is by applying credit number conversion and wide open opportunities for librarians to develop their careers through training, training and further study in S1 and S2. However,

- there are problems related to the characteristics of Kemenristekdikti as the parent institution UM which cause (1) limitation of librarianship career paths only to the positions of middle librarians in room IV / c and (2) non-compliance of some librarians to the regulations on professional development activities and the obligation to take competency tests librarian.
- 2. Supporting factors from the implementation of Permenpan-RB Number 9 of 2014 at UM are (1) compensation obtained by librarians, (2) retirement age limits and opportunities to achieve higher ranks, and (3) great motivation from librarians to develop his inhibiting career. **Factors** implementation of Permenpan-RB Number 9 of 2014 in UM are (1) lack of responsiveness of the Ministry of Research and Technology in processing proposals for promotion / librarian ranks, causing delays in decree on promotion / rank of librarians, and (2) limited number of competent civil servants inpassing the position of librarian.

#### **REFERENCES**

- [1]. Permenpan-RB Nomor 9 Tahun 2014 Tentang Jabatan Fungsional Pustakawan dan Angka Kreditnya.
- [2]. Sutino. 2011. Jenjang Jabatan, Motivasi dan Prestasi Kerja Pustakawan: Studi Kasus pada Pustakawan Penyelia di Perpustakaan Universitas Gadjah Mada dan Universitas Negeri Yogyakarta. Jurnal FKP2T, 4 (1):22-32.
- [3]. Noh, Y. 2011. A study on the conceptualization of librarians' career movement and identification of antecedents. *Journal of Librarianship and Information Science*, 43(4), 213-223.
- [4]. Astuti, Panti. 2016. Faktor-faktor yang mempengaruhi terhadap kenaikan pangkat/jabatan pustakawan. *IQRA': Jurnal Perpustakaan dan Informasi*, 10(1).
- [5]. Parsons, Wayne. 2008. Public Policy: Pengantar Teori dan Praktik Analisis Kebijakan. Jakarta: Kencana
- [6]. Suwitri, Sri. 2010. Administrasi Negara, Kebijakan Publik: Reformasi dan Transformasi. Yogyakarta: Graha Ilmu
- [7]. Wahab. 2012. Analisis Kebijakan: Dari Formulasi ke Penyusunan Model-model Implementasi Kebijakan Publik. Jakarta: Bumi Aksara

- [8]. Grindle, M. S. 2017. *Politics and Policy Implementation in the Third World.* Princeton University Press.
- [9]. Miles, Matthew B.; Huberman, A. Michael; Saldana, Johnny. 2014. *Qualitative Data Analysis: A Methods Source Book*. California: Sage.
- [10]. Hasbullah, M. 2016. Kebijakan Pendidikan:

  Dalam Perspektif Teori, Aplikasi, dan
  Konsdisi Objektif Pendidikan di Indonesia.

  Jakarta: Rajawali Pers
- [11]. Rahardjo, Mudjia. 2010. *Pemikiran Kebijakan Pendidikan Kontemporer*. Malang: UIN Maliki Press.
- [12]. Trislianto, Dimas Agung. 2016. Analisis Faktor-Faktor Pengembangan Karir Pustakawan. *Journal Unair*. Tersedia di (<a href="http://journal.unair.ac.id">http://journal.unair.ac.id</a> /downloadfullpapers-palime2469deb2c2full.pdf)
  Diakses 12 Maret 2018.
- [13]. Andriaty, Etty dan Hendrawaty. 2013. Kajian Penilaian Angka Kredit Pustakawan Lingkup Kementerian Pertanian. *Jurnal Perpustakaan Pertanian*, 22 (1): 24-29
- [14]. Permenpan-RB Nomor 26 Tahun 2016 tentang pengangkatan PNS Dalam Jabatan Fungsional Melalui Inpassing.
- [15]. Wibowo. 2012. *Manajemen Kinerja*. Jakarta: Rajawali Pers
- [16]. Fatmawati, Endang. 2014. Kajian Faktor Yang Berpengaruh Dalam Kenaikan Pangkat/ Jabatan Pustakawan. *Jurnal Iqra'*, 8 (1):1-13