

Women's Participation in Rural Development (A Gender Study on the Women's Involvement in *Musrenbangdes* in the Villages District Blayu and Patokpicis Wajak Malang)

Ahmad Jaenudin^{1*}, Darsono Wisadirana², Sholih Mu'adi³

Sociology
Faculty of Social Science and Political Science
University of Brawijaya

Abstract

The patriarchate pattern in the rural society limits the right and obligaten among women to contribute in rural development through *musrenbangdes*. The main problem of the research is how is women participation in rural development through *musrenbangdes*? The aim of this research is to analyze the positions, forms, and factors that influence the women participation. This is a qualitative research, using PRA Robert Chambers approachment, snowballing sampling technigue, primary data collecting technigue through; observation, interview, FGD. And secondary data collecting through; documents, data validity examination technique, source based triangulation, and data management technique; Miles and Huberman interactive analysis. Results; 1) Contribution position in administrative and consumption field, 2) Direct contribution in programme planning and programme accomplishment, indirect contribution as a participator and moral supporting, 3) Supporting factors; women awareness, socialization and invitation, chance to be part of stakeholder, male support. As the carrier factors; unsuitable schedule of the *musrenbangdes* for the women, the women multiple roles, lack of socialization and invitation, low level of education. Summary, the inferior position and women minimun contribution due to some internal and external factors from the women side themselves. As consideration, it is necessary for the rural government to increase the socialization, the awareness of the female , increasing male support, and the importance of women rural leader.

Keywords: Participation, Women, Rural Development, *Musrenbangdes*

INTRODUCTION

Background of the Study.

The recent issuance of UU No. 6/2014 (Law on village regulation) on principle of the participation, equality and empowerment, has been increasing the marginalisation of women in rural development, especially in their urban region that includes several hamlets. Moreover, referring to the act in article 58 clause 1, BPD (*Badan Perwakilan Desa* – Village Representative Body) takes the role as consideration of the composition under the village consultative body, which becomes a reference for the implementation of democracy in the rural area. Also, it acts as a form of governance's gravity in reinforcing the gender aspects, by means of a guidance in improving women's capability, particularly in rural areas where is still considered to be lagging behind.

The previous explanation turns into a symbol of democracy, which is, today, struggling for the

gender aspects from the governance in order to grow the women's capacity that may lead to be an index of their rural development.

The women's participation in developing rural area provoke different perceptions or views among individuals, since the culture constructions have put up the citizens' paradigm in placing a woman in their social environment [1]. This point of view reveals the women's position in the environment, and it is clearly hard to change the understanding in the society relating to the part of women. This condition, likes patriarchy, could inhibit the contribution of women in their area.

Nowadays, the women's participation – related issues are still relatively low, starting from the positions, forms of participation and the factors. The involvement of women in the modern era cannot be separated from the role of the men. As similar to the situation, this study attempts to analyse the women's involvement in rural development, which had been concerned on the

Correspondence address:

Ahmad Jaenudin

Email : ahmad724jaenudin@gmail.com

Address : Blok Karanganyar RT/RW 10/03, Desa
Kedungwungu, Kecamatan Krangkeng,
Kabupaten Indramayu, Pos 45284

Musrenbangdes (Rural Development Planning Meeting).

Governance has conducted numerous hard works to portray issue relating to the low involvement of women. Yet, it is quietly needed to hold a research on women's involvement. For instance, the forms of women's participation in Mangrove conservation that was still in the low rate. Rather, there was 2% of women's involvement, was categorized as low achievement, in cooperative activities and paying cooperative group women dues [2].

It can be described that the women's contribution in the local governance activities fall into the low category. Under this situation, the researcher interests in having study on define and investigate the positions, forms, supporter as well as resistor factors for rising women's capability in *Musrenbangdes*. The role of women through involvement will significantly determine their rights and obligations in the rural development programs.

There was lack of control from the steering committee and the executive about the women's participation, then the chairman of commission and the head of women's representative team had not met the minimum quota, which was 30%, linking to the mayor regulation No. 18A/2009 [3]. According to these phenomena, it could be known that women's involvement in *Musrenbangdes* is less control, it should be distinguished that women have direct participation and deserve to gain position and strategic authority. More specifically, the dominant role of men tending to override the women's role, can influence the division of burden. However, the equalization of performance will foster and advance the women's ability and competence to develop the rural area.

That matter shows that the study about women's participation is importance to be conducted. The study is useful for providing consideration the progress of village development that is inseparable from the whole community involvement, as well as the women. Besides, the village success may be reached by well-informed about the community needs and capability.

Statement of the Problem

Based on the background of the study, the research problem of this study can be formulated as: have the *Musrenbangdes* in the Blayu and Patokpici villages involved women? Then, how are the positions, forms, and factors of women's involvement in *Musrenbangdes*?

Purpose and Significance of the Study

This is useful as control for the researcher to analyse the existed problem. Theoretically, the finding of study can be used for adding insight and enriching knowledge about gender and women's participation in rural development, specifically in planning for the participatory development in *Musrenbangdes*.

Practically, governance can solve the problem linking to the rural development and women, precisely, in order to attempt to streamline the involvement of women. Furthermore, for women, it can be used for increasing capability in the standard of living and social status.

Materials and Methods

Material: Basic Theory

This study firstly engages gender approach and development (GaD), which then had advanced by Moser gender analysis. GaD, today, is well-known as an effort to elevate women's capacity, because women take a part of agent of change in some of sustainable development activities that have not been looked at the women side.

The supporter theory is coming from *Participatory Rural Appraisal* (PRA) by Robert Chambers, it benefits for a guideline in examining issues of women's involvement and participatory planning in *Musrenbangdes*.

Material: Understanding of Concepts

- 1) Women's involvement that researcher meant are how the women get involved in the village apparatus or *Musrenbangdes*, which cover the involvement on the planning, implementing and evaluating process.
- 2) Maskun S. (1995) states that rural development can be described as the whole developmental activities that are going on the village, and cover all aspects of community that is implemented in an integrated manner by developing self-help organization, which is essentially a development of self-reliance and self-help so that people can upgrade themselves to gain the better life [4].
- 3) *Musrenbangdes* is a community participatory planning which aimed to arrange the plan of rural development in the medium and long-time span that has been mentioned in the UU No.25/2004.

Methods: Research Method

The design of this research was qualitative which described and summarized the various conditions, situations or variables [5]. Then, the used approach was *Participatory Rural Appraisal*

(PRA) that had been noted by Robert Chambers, this approach emphasized on the importance of the process of *sharing of knowledge* among the researcher and the informant where the research was conducted.

Substantially focus of this research was the women's involvement in the *Musrenbangdes*, which could be described: 1) the position of women's involvement which were stated the employment or women's strategic place of work., 2) the forms of involvement that were describing type of involvement in either directly or indirectly, and 3) the participations' factors that were supporting and resisting factors.

Research was directed to the Blayu and Patokpicias villages, Wajak sub district, Malang district. Including two villages in this study was a method in comparing the level of organizing *Musrenbangdes* in those villages. Then, the previous researcher also applied the same instrument as the current research that observed the involvement of all women's in their research villages.

The sampling technique that had been used was *Snowballing Sampling*, it was done since the researcher had not deeply figured the informants out in those area.

The researcher employed the mainly informant for the primary information, as well as the secondary informants, who played as proponent information. In order to attain and fit up the required data during investigation, the researcher engaged those kinds of data.

The measurement technique from the instruments was completed by triangulation, which was cited by Dezin, 1978 [6], triangulation was thru by discriminating four triangulations to be measurement technique by using 1) sources, 2) methods, 3) investigator or researcher, and 4) theories. The used triangulation technique meant comparing and rechecking the degree of confidence in the obtained information through different times and tools [7]. Referring to the technique, the researcher firstly compared the result of observation with interviews. Next, the researcher compared the interview result with a content of document which allied to the study.

The information processing technique was by using Miles and Huberman interactive analysis [8]., it was beginning with collecting data, reducing data, displaying data, and summarizing.

Data Collection

The technique of data collection referred to the qualitative research design. Firstly, the

researcher observed the location where the study was directed, the researcher had two roles at once that was being a community members and the informant who attended the activities in *Musrenbangdes*. Secondly, the researcher held interview section with unstructured instructions. The reason behind that treatment was the researcher's expectation to gain deepest information which could answer the research problems and objectives. Thirdly, the researcher put the intimacy with the informant during the research into a photo. In addition, the documentation also recorded the activities to carry out qualitative research method. Lastly, via *focus group discussion* (FGD) advantaged for additional information to look for further information, such as the background and condition of the object and informant in the research sites.

RESULT AND DISCUSSION

1. The Position of Women's Involvement

Debating about the position of women's involvement was divided into two segments, which were:

1) Women's position in the village apparatus

Women and village are two issues that cannot be divided. Today, village plays as a unit of government and the presence of regional autonomy creates a village as a form of decentralization. This condition strengthens the village roles to manage their area based on the community needs. Subsequently, the existence of village's authority may lead to the direction of village development. What is happening on the rural or village development should be well-known by all members community, including women. As well as men, women have roles and positions in the village.

Women' participation in the bureaucracy is still not moving to be higher. In this research, the women's position in the village apparatus had not met the need, it is reported that the number of women is not reaching out 30%.

The research finding showed that in the research sites, women tended to place on administrative and financial affairs. The result derived from the assumption that women had more accuracy and competency than men in the administration field.

2) Women's position in *Musrenbangdes*

The researcher encountered four positions of the women through their involvement in *Musrenbangdes*, they were:

a. Women' position dan *Musrenbangdes'* stakeholders

The finding showed that the women's position in *Musrenbangdes* was influenced by the Stakeholders. There was a tendency where Stakeholders or village apparatus assign their wives to go side by side in every agenda, in the attendance rate, it tended to put the wives of village apparatus in prior. Ideally, the women's position in *Musrenbangdes* could come from any society without exception. Unfortunately, the women's position intended to be determined by the village apparatus.

Well, actually this problem was an issue of participatory planning, from its concepts which had to be openly prior to all community, so that they could get involved. Yet, some of village apparatus had lack of attention to let other women in front of society to actively give contribution to the village governance or *Musrenbangdes*.

b. Women's position in Administration

There was a plenty of involvement where lied women on the administration field. This duty had been formerly specified its job description and function by the village apparatus who had an authority to did that. This situation could be worse when women were merely in administrative and financial affairs, because comparing to the men who could flexibly occupy in any position of village apparatus or *Musrenbangdes*. Afterwards, women were more considered to be always ready and accurate in the administration domain, as well women were more attractive to host the guest.

c. Women's position in consumption field

Women and consumption is like a twin in the community. This notion had also been found in this study, women identically knew and were more knowledgeable in serving the need in every agenda of *Musrenbangdes*. It had already been known that women were more skilled than man. More interestingly, some of women, usually placed on the consumption and administration affairs, actively conveyed their idea at the planning forum of *Musrenbangdes*. The informants added that those active women were mostly the wives of village apparatus, they knew very well what happened and what going to happen because they enthusiastically went after the village programs.

d. Women's position as a complement

The public's disclosure to the role of women is already widespread, both at rural and urban area. Unfortunately, the researcher resulted that there was an opinion about the role of women as a

complement. Whereas, the women's involvement in *Musrenbangdes* should occupy all the society members, without any allowance of women. That assumption was considered incompatible with the principle of participatory planning. The informants remarked that the dominant roles of men increase that opinion in the society associated to the women's participation.

The women's positions in this research were still underdeveloped. Those were indicated by the position that put into the women during the *Musrenbangdes* still in the administration, financial and consumption affairs. It should be noted that the women's and men's involvement must be in balance, since the concept of gender equality had been declared in the development. Inappropriately, the space for women in the organization were still restricted and determined by the men.

Governance had attempted to realize the principle of participatory planning. Theoretically, the approach of gender and development was a way to overcome the gender gap by giving a chance to women to get involved in rural development program.

Further, those findings were connected to Moser (1993) gender analysis, through analysis of labour and work division pattern (the profile of agenda). The analysis could be seen how the stakeholders involve women or group of women, like women organization, to be aware of gender equality in participatory planning. Then, based on the objective of analysis, the researcher wanted to ensure the women's need which could be include to the village planning process in realizing gender equality and justice at the family and community level.

Meanwhile, the findings revealed that the stakeholders less involve women as a whole, the involvement included administration, consumption, and the role of women as a complement in the participatory planning. Those positions resulted in the weaknesses of women's decision-making power.

Related to the low women's involvement, it needed to be improved about the women's involvement in many ways. For example, the village apparatus could recruit more women in the structure of village administrations and *Musrenbangdes* committees. Along with gender equality and rural development, women must optimize their ability in the participatory planning. The women's involvement could help women to upgrade their capability.

2. The forms of women's involvement

This section provides the forms of women involvement, which could be defined as several actions from women directly whether during the implementation of *Musrenbangdes* or not, those were:

1) Direct involvement

The direct involvement of women in *Musrenbangdes* was a priority of participatory planning, which were:

a. Involvement in planning forum

The women through their involvement in the planning forum are importance, because it will set the women's rights and obligations that has been poured in the village program, that has been proposed in the planning forum. The research findings also reported that women identically deliver their women's problem, such as health care or *PKK (Pembinaan/ pemberdayaan Kesejahteraan Keluarga – Family Welfare Development Program)*, which was totally difference with the men who were proposing infrastructure of the village needs.

b. Involvement in program implementation

The women's participation was not only when they were in the *Musrenbangdes*, but also when the implementation. Women also actively participated in the *PKK or Posyandu (Pos Pelayanan Terpadu – Integrated Health Service clinic)*. It showed that women directly took part in the agenda, and their activeness was useful to support the village program that had been running on.

2) Indirect involvement

The forms of indirect involvement were the women's support in *Musrenbangdaes*, which were:

a. Involvement as a participant

The findings showed that in many cases, women were not maximally involved on the *Musrenbangdes*. It was known by the lack of women's involvement in the committees, most of women to be a participant or social audience. There was lack of authority which voiced about the role of women in the committees of *Musendangdes*, it would be useful to manage the planning forum. Consequently, a lot of women just came and seated to enjoy the event, women only took the concept from the committee for granted. There was a poor feedback for woman in determining the meetings outcome. The women who expressed active respond was tended to the wives of village apparatus.

b. The women's moral support

The women who did not directly participate in *Musrenbangdes*, intended to be more actively join the program in rural development that had run. They were joining that program because it could be exposed as a part of moral support in order to show their care about participatory planning in their area. It could be indicated by material donation by the women, then they tended to be reluctant to engage in the planning forum, since they felt that their rights and obligations had already represented by the wives of village apparatus.

The all findings could be associated to the Moser (1993) gender analysis. It might be seen that the women' forms of involvement belonged to the pattern of access profile analysis (opportunities) and control (strength in decision making). The forms dialed with physical and social-cultural resources, like in information media, education, and training skills.

Through this analysis pattern, it benefited for analyzing the forms of involvement on the findings, especially concerning on the women and *Musrenbangdes*. The findings resulted that there is an involvement of women while performing *Musrenbangdes*, besides, it also existed indirectly women's involvement as participants and moral supporter in the participatory planning.

It could not be regretted that the woman's involvement in planning forum also had been analysed. It might be understood that *Musrenbangdes* is a village level consultative forum to determine the village program. Meanwhile, the result of findings showed that more than a half of women were enthusiast in joining the forum, even though in a low attendance rate when compared to men.

The informants from two research sites supported the planning forum, because the women's involvement highly established their rights and obligations in their villages. The decision making of women have a tendency to prioritize their own feminine activities, for example, their involvement in the health care and household welfare or *Posyandu* and *PKK*.

More specifically, the media of decision-making from women was inseparable from women's interest groups, as they were coming from *Posyandu* frontline and The *PKK* driving team.

On contrary with the men team, planning forum tended to prioritize physical media, that make the assumption that men were more knowledgeable in the physically rural need, rather

women who were connecting to the health care media and household welfare.

3. Involvement Factors

UU on the village regulation No. 6/2004 establish the principle of participation, equality and empowerment, as a chance for the community to get involved in all rural development agenda, one of which is *Musrenbangdes*. Yet, the implementation of that agenda had not fulfilled the society, particularly a woman. This section presents the problem descriptions, including the supporting and resisting factors of women's involvement in *Musrenbangdes*. The explanations would be delivered as follows:

1) Supporting factor

a. The women's awareness to participate

A reason of women's involvement is their awareness to participate in *Musrenbangdes*. Actually, this program had already written as a women's empowerment program from the governance to each woman in rural area. The women's awareness included their effort to find out what was designed by *Musrenbangdes*, because their knowing would be helpful for determining the village program that had been approved and held. Further, the awareness of wives of village apparatus could also boosted the village government activities.

b. Socialization and invitation to participate

To invite the women through their involvement in every agenda that has been holding by the *Musrenbangdes* forum, could be done by spread out the socialization and invitation to the participants. Based on the findings, invitation was being a priority for women's involvement. The invitation was directed to the community by village apparatus or the committee. In addition, spreading invitation and socialization was a serious action of village apparatus in gaining more presence of women to attend the *Musrenbangdes* event.

c. A chance for women to participate

The principle of participatory planning that has been performance by *Musrenbandes*, opened up an opportunity or a chance for women to convey their aspiration. It should be noted that the women's involvement who helped or replaced the position of men had not been well targeted, because it was not in accordance with the participatory principle.

This result showed that women could be more active on public sphere, with the existence of

chance to represent the woman groups or replaced the men who was her husband and active in village apparatus.

d. A support by her husband

The ongoing involvement of women could not be separated from the role of man who became husbands. The results found that the role of husband significantly determined the women's spaces. The role of each man and woman has already mentioned in the basic concept of gender. The women's involvement in *Musrenbangdes* should be enthusiastically supported by the men, who persuaded them to acquire their rights and obligations. It was interesting, because in rural area still closely adhered to patriarchy, which restricted the women's work space outside the home.

2) Resisting factor

Problems faced by women, starting from household, social, level of knowledge or education, are often being barriers for them to be active in rural development, such the results of the following study which has been mentioned as:

a. Timetable of *Musrenbangdes* event

The event of *Musrenbangdes* in 2017 had held in the evening to night, this timing became an obstacle for women to attend the event because at that time they should be at home with their family. Prevailing norms and cultures restricted women's movement in the evening or at night. In contrast, Patokpicis village held the event at noon, which was a favorable time for women to be there, since they had enough time to join in every agenda in the *Musrenbangdes* event.

b. Double burden of women

Household activities make a woman have to tackle a double role at once, at the same time, working outside the home sufficiently put the women up to be bothered in divining their time. The results of study also found that the double role of women created a difficulty for women through their involvement in *Musrenbangdes*, several women who acted as housewives could not be maximally on duty in joining participatory planning of *Musrenbangdes*. The household problems in those villages tended to be imposed on women, dissimilar with the men who had a tendency to work outside the home to provide their families. Interestingly, some informants claimed to have ability to divide the activities of husband or wife to constantly come along the *Musrebandes*.

c. Lack of socialization and unilateral invitation

Patriarchal culture believes that the movement symbol in the organization lies on man, because they are considered worthy to lead. The researcher noted that the provision of socialization and invitation tended to favour the men. This condition could be seen from the percentages of the presence of men which was greater than women. Only a small number of women accepted the invitation. This result reflected that the village administration or *Musrenbangdes* committee put aside the presence of women.

d. Lack of women's education

The education level reflects their understanding in deciding their behaviour, particularly in the rural area that was less attention to the women's education. The results of the study noted that the unevenness of human resources hampered the women's involvement in *Musrenbangdes*. The level of women's education at there was still low, it was difference from the man, who had been successfully gained the college level. The different level of education distinguished the level of understanding between the *Musrenbangdes* participants, mainly in addressing the importance of participatory planning that put in prior what the community need.

Reacting to the factors of women's involvement, the researcher connected it to Moser (1993) gender analysis with the pattern of factors analysis. It was used to describe access and control profiles that could be used to analyse the supporting or resisting factors in a program. In this research, the studied program was *Musrenbangdes*, the scope of study was culture, education, village social-political circumstances, rule of law or applicable values and norms, and others. Followingly, the results showed the supporting or resisting factors which was suitable with the participatory concepts. The women's involvement was in accordance to the women's critical awareness. Their involvement benefited for enhancing the women's capability on the continuous changing, chiefly on the rural development that expected to improve community's welfare.

Further, the women's involvement and development was still ambiguous and not equally spread out among the community. The women's involvement had much benefits, including providing the women's independence and internal strength in participatory planning. In addition, the equality of rights and obligations

between men and women was still not balanced, this could be an access and a control that was not evenly distributed, and the rights and obligations of women were not fulfilled. While on the findings of resisting factors, the internal and external factors of women resulted less involved in *Musrenbangdes*. The problems were due to the gender gap in access and control, in this case the special attention from village apparatus was needed to facilitate the women spaces to move and trainings.

CONCLUSION

Referring to the analysis, the researcher concluded:

1. The women's position in involvement

The position of women's involvement in *Musrenbangdes* in 2017 that had been held by Blayu and Patokpicis villages, had not met the 30% of quota from the total number of participants among men and women during the event. But, although the percentage of the women was still minimal, they were able to compete with the men to participate in the committee when the event was holding.

2. The forms of women's involvement in *Musrenbangdes*

There were two forms of women's involvement in *Musrenbangdes*, which were direct and indirect involvement. In direct involvement, women were involved in participatory and implementation *Musrenbangdes* program. Their direct involvement helped to obtain rights and obligations, convey their thought in the forum as well.

In indirect involvement, women intended to be participants and the existence of moral support from women side to retain their rights and obligations on the result of participatory planning programs in the village. This was also manifested by women to assist their husband working on the village program that had run.

3. The supporting and resisting factors of women's involvement in *Musrenbangdes*

The conclusion of driving factors was described as: the presence of women's awareness to get involved; the provision of socialization and invitation from village apparatus to the women was a form of making them understand in order to attain their enthusiast to participate to the program; the given opportunities to engage, there was a chance for women to be village apparatus to persuade other women; giving invitation to the women is a part of their involvement; the

women's husband eagerly supported and encouraged their wives to get involved.

For the resisting factors, the description were; the time of *Musrenbangdes* event tended to be less impartial for women, it was because the agenda began in the evening; double burden that has not been resolved by women to manage their activities outside their home; the tendency of lack of socialization and unilateral invitation, the village apparatus put more priority on men; lack of women's education in a half of women total number resulted in lack of caring and understanding to support the sustainability of *Musrenbangdes*.

Based on the presentation, below are some suggestions for the women:

- 1) The necessary of female awareness to contribute due to improve the women capability, as the effort to improve the capability, women has to actively involved or become an agent, and not just as a participative development performer.
- 2) The necessary of women rural leader is to establish a democratic support, and to ensure that the policy of the rural government is made for the sake of every member of the rural society as has become the agreement from the rural citizen.
- 3) Women Female leader has to maximize the participation of the representations, especially for those who already joined in society organization in order to contribute in participative development.
- 4) Women has to be capable to negotiate with male about the subject of support and chance to contribute, in order to get the women right and obligation in every field.
- 5) The rural government has to improve and maximize the socialization to the women about the goal and the benefit of the *musrenbangdes*, this is can be use to understand the importance of women participation to create the critical awareness.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENT

All praise to Allah, the Most Gracious and Merciful, who gave the researcher knowledge to finish this thesis journal.

The researcher express the deep sense of gratitude to Prof. Dr. Ir. Darsono Wisadirana, MS as the first advisor, and Dr. Sholih Muadi, SH.,MS as the second advisor. Their dedication in supporting and advising have been accounted for

completing this research, starting the preliminary study to reporting it.

The village apparatus and the community in Patokpicis and Blayu village, Wajak sub district, Malang district, and all researcher's fellows, they have given the researcher cooperation and moral support to finish this journal writing. Special thanks to the researcher's profound love, *Mama* and *Mami*, the elder/young brothers and sisters for their endless support, affection and caring.

REFERENCES

- [1].Lestari, A. M. (2013). *Partisipasi Perempuan dalam Proses Pemberdayaan Melalui PNPMM Mandiri Perkotaan (Studi Kasus di Desa Tanjungkarang, Kecamatan Jati, Kabupaten Kudus)*. Dipetik Desember 19, 2016, dari Perpustakaan Unnes Layani Digital Library: <http://lib.unnes.ac.id/18044/1/3401409032.pdf>
- [2].Pratisti, C., Hery, S., & Suadi. (2012). *Partisipasi Perempuan dalam Konservasi Mangrove di Desa Pasar Banggi Kabupaten Rembang*. Dipetik Januari 14, 2017, dari Jurnal Perikanan UGM: <https://jurnal.ugm.ac.id/jfs/article/view/9047/6785>
- [3].Ekawati, S. (2010). *Partisipasi Perempuan Dalam Musyawarah Perencanaan Pembangunan (Studi Deskriptif Kualitatif Tentang Partisipasi Perempuan Dalam Musyawarah Perencanaan Pembangunan Di Kelurahan Joyosuran, Kecamatan Pasar Kliwon, Kota Surakarta)*. Dipetik Januari 15, 2017, dari UNS Institutional Repository: <https://eprints.uns.ac.id/3065/1/148721608201011471.pdf>.
- [4].Siswijono, S. B., & Darsono, W. (2008). *Sosiologi Pedesaan dan Perkotaan*. Malang: Agritek
- [5].Moleong, L. J. (2002). *Metode Penelitian Kualitatif*. Bandung: PT Remaja Rosdakarya.
- [6].----- (2002). *Metode Penelitian Kualitatif*. Bandung: PT Remaja Rosdakarya.
- [7].----- (2002). *Metode Penelitian Kualitatif*. Bandung: PT Remaja Rosdakarya.
- [8].Sugiyono. (2008). *Memahami Penelitian Kualitatif*. Bandung: Alfabeta.